Tiit-Rein Viitso Department of Finno-Ugric Studies University of Tartu

Early Metallurgy in Language: The History of Metal Names in Finnic¹

In contrast to other continents, domestication of the horse made the inhabitants of the Eurasian steppes and forest steppes more mobile. Invention of smelting metals resulted in the mastering and use of more productive tools and more effective weapons. Metallic tools and weapons became important trade articles, and the vocabulary corresponding to these items spread over language and language family borders. Small nomadic or semi-nomadic mobile bands began to join together in order to raid, conquer new territories, and subjugate their neighbors. Other sedentary bands were forced to consolidate into larger groups in order to resist such attempts and practised a partly similar lifestyle. Unstable bands, tribes, and other minorities were assimilated into these larger consolidated groups. Whole languages and language families disappeared more quickly than earlier.

This article is an attempt to study metal names in the F-U languages starting from the very earliest point of their appearance in these languages. Although the Finnic languages are the focus of this study, the considerable, though weakly studied, background of this issue within the larger context of the Finno-Ugric languages is not ignored and is incorporated into an analysis seeking to identify shared features among the Finno-Ugric languages.

1. Metal names in Finno-Ugric

In the Finno-Ugric languages, most metal names are borrowings. In Table 1, the raised prefix letters indicate the origin of the names mainly following traditional views as expressed in Aulis J. Joki's important book "Uralier und Indogermanen" (1953) and in later etymological dictionaries, primarily in KÈSKJa, LÄGLOS, MNyTESz, MSzFE, UEW, SSA. Table 1 does not take into account etymologies presented in the posthumously published book by Hartmut Katz (2003), as many of them are vaguely argued and linguistically inadequate.

^{1.} The study was supported by Estonian Science Council project No. SF0180076s08.

In the following sections, the names of copper, gold, and iron in the Finno-Ugric languages will be analyzed in order to discuss the existing views on the contacts of the Finno-Ugrians at the beginning of Metal Ages, i.e. of the Bronze Age and Iron Age. Still it should be remembered that during the European Metal Ages the production of alloys like bronze or brass from different metals originating in different areas was based on longer local traditions of smelting copper, tin, or lead from a local ore.

Names for tin, lead, and silver will be discussed only inasmuch as they are etymologically related to names for copper or iron.

2. Names of gold

2.1. The Finnic and Saamic names for gold are borrowed from different Germanic sources. The Finnic name **kulta* is historically an older loan than the Saamic name **kullē* because in certain Scandinavian dialects the Proto-Germanic consonant cluster was simplified, cf. Proto-Germanic and Proto-Scandinavian **gulpa*, Gothic *gulp*, Swedish and Danish *guld* vs. Old Norse, Icelandic, Faeroese, and Norwegian *gull* (cf., however, Old Swedish *goll* and Estonian Swedish *gull* as an indication that older and newer forms have existed side by side for a very long time). Old Swedish makes it possible to speculate that the Finnic form was received somewhere farther in the south from the historically attested Finnic area and the historically older forms may have been restored in one part of Swedish dialects due to language-external reasons.

2.2. Gold names in other Finno-Ugric languages are of Iranian origin. (Note that the Samoyedic languages are not discussed in the current paper.) The names for gold of Iranian origin are borrowed separately and from different sources (Joki 1973: 250). The words denoting 'gold' are listed in the first column from the left in Table 1. In addition, Iranian gold names have undergone a semantic shift in Moksha, Konda Mansi, Vah and Vasjugan Khanty and serve as copper names. The names can be divided into two layers.

In the oldest layer of borrowings, namely Hungarian *arany*, Vah Khanty $l\bar{o}r\dot{n}s$, Vasjugan Khanty $j\bar{o}r\dot{n}i$, and Moksha *sersi*, the original Iranian initial consonant *z*-, cf. Avestan *zaranya* 'gold', has been substituted by **s*. The Proto-Ugric **s* was lost in Hungarian, shifted to *A*, and is still preserved as such in Kazym and Surgut dialects, and later regularly merged into *l* in Vah and into *j* in Vasjugan dialect. In Mansi, the Ugric **s* is represented as *t* as well as in Central Ob and Irtysh Khanty. Furthermore, it is possible that also Konda Mansi $t\bar{a}re\dot{n}$ and Pelym Mansi *tarin*' copper' may belong to this series; still one cannot entirely exclude the possibility that these Mansi words go back to an Iranian source, such as Old Persian *daraniya* 'gold'. The same problem is true for the Pelym variant *tarn*e' copper'.

All other Mansi and Khanty words denoting gold are characterized by a word-initial *s*- and represent a later layer of borrowings. As the initial *s*- in Ugric

inherited vocabulary and old Indo-European loans originates from the earlier consonant **s* and there is no known reason to suppose a palatalized sibilant in Iranian, the Mansi and Khanty words for gold are usually considered loans from Komi.

It must be noted that both layers contain phonological stems with the patterns (C)VCVC and CVCC(V), of which gold names of the latter type are unknown in Iranian. Compared to them, the Moksha form *serä* 'copper' may have risen as a result of local simplification of a longer form, although it may also be a direct loan, due to the fact that in the best known modern Iranian languages the shorter pattern CVC prevails, cf. Kurdish zêr, (New) Persian, Tajiki and Dari zar. Like in Finno-Ugric, there are back and front vocalic stem variants also in Iranian, cf. Avestan zaranya, Persian zar vs. Ossetic zærin, Kurdish zêr. No stem form with *i* in the initial syllable is attested in Iranian. However, the Sanskrit gold name hiranya has i. Hence, it is unclear whether the vowel of the first syllable in Erzya sirne and Moksha śirne reflects a similar phonological form or pronunciation of an Iranian source language or whether it results from a local change. The great variation in West Iranian languages such as Avestan, Kurdish, Persian, Tajiki may be late, but this can neither be proven nor refuted. There is no evidence on the pattern variation in Northwest Iranian in which the word is attested only in Ossetic. There seems to exist only one Iranian language where the stem has the pattern CVCVC, namely Ossetic zærin.

Thus probably the set of separate loans denoting 'gold' from Iranian includes up to six stem types: (1a) Moksha *śerəń*; (1b) Konda Mansi *tāreń*; (1c) Hungarian *arany*; (1d) Vah Khanty *lōrń3* 'copper', Vasjugan Khanty *jōrńi* 'copper', Surgut Khanty *ʌŏrńi* - 'brass';² (2a) Erzya *siŗńe*, Moksha *śirńe*, Mari *šörtńö* (< **serńe*; *-t-* maybe inserted by analogy of *körtńö*, *kərtńi* 'iron'); (2b) Permic *zarńi*, Mansi and Khanty *sVrńV*. In other words, in order to borrow the first type (1a–d), at least two Finno-Ugric languages or dialects must have been in contact with Iranian and at least two Finno-Ugric languages or dialects must also have been in contact with Iranian in order to receive the stems of the second layer (2a–b). To explain this variation in Finno-Ugric, Hartmut Katz (2003: 258) tries to derive all types from different stages of Proto-Iranian. Nevertheless, it is to be noted that all these hypothetical stages altogether cannot adequately reflect a meaningful history of a single Iranian language, such as Ossetic. Conclusively, there must have been different contacts with Iranian languages.

Finally, on the basis of the geographical distribution of gold names the Finno-Ugric linguistic area is divided into two zones, namely into (a) Saamic and Finnic that borrowed the word for 'gold' from the Germanic languages, and (b) into Mordvinic, Mari, Permic, and Ugric in which the word denoting 'gold' was borrowed from the Iranian languages. The first zone is the sphere of Germanic influences and the second zone the sphere of Iranian influences.

^{2.} In Krasnoyarskiy Irtyš Khanty the form $\bar{o}r\dot{n}_3$ 'gold' (KT 874a) is used in folklore texts instead of the usual noun $s\bar{o}r\dot{n}_3$. Phonologically, $\bar{o}r\dot{n}_3$ represents the type (2c). Note that types (1c) and (2c) share the loss of the Proto-Ugric initial *s that is otherwise characteristic of Hungarian.

	Gold	Iron	Copper	Steel	Tin	Lead	Silver
Saami S	^s güllie	^S ruövdie	Noguäppere	^{No} staalie	^S didnie		^S s' ïlbe
Saami N	^s gol'le	^s ruow'de	^A veai'ke	^{No} stálli	^S dâdne	^N laddjo	^S sil'bâ
Saami I	^s kolle	^s ryev'di	Aveški	^{No} stääli	^S tane	^N lajo	^S silba
Saami Ki	^s kå'll	^S rū'vvd	^A vie'ššk	^{Ru} stā'll	^S ta'nn	^{Ru} vį nts	^S sjllb
Finnish	^G kulta	Grauta	^A vaski	teräs	^S tina	Swlyijy	hopea
			^{Sw} kupari				
Karelian S	^G kulda	Grauda	Avaski	teräz	s	tina	hobie
Veps C	Gkuld	Graud	^A vaśk		^S tin		hobed
Estonian	Gkuld	Graud	Avask	teras	^S tina	^S seatina	hõbe
Livonian	^G kūlda	^G rōda	^A vašk	^G tierōda	^S tinā	Lasvinā	õbdõ
Erzya	^I sį r'ne	^I kšńi	piže	^{Ru} stal'	1	kive	^I śija
	^I śirńə	^I kšńi	^I śerəń	^{Ru} stal'		kivə	^I śije
Moksha			^I śerä				
Mari H	^I šörtńö	^I kürtńö	^B würye·ne	Twurs	FUwulno	^{FU} wüδwulno	^I šij
Mari M	^I šörtń <i>â</i>	^I kərthi	Bwəryeńə	Twurs	FUwulnô	^{FU} wəówulnə	Iši
Udmurt	^I zarńi	^I kort	Birgon	^I andan	Auzveś	^A śęd uzveś	Aazveś
Komi	^I zarńi	¹ kert	^B įrgęn	^I jemdon	^A ozjś	Rusvińeć	^A eziś
Mansi N	^I sōrńi	^I kēr	Baryin	^I ēmtan	Iānaχ	Aātwəs	FUśālyoln
Mansi Ko	^I sarəń	^I kēr	Bäryən	ėàtėm kēr	1	Aoat ws	FUöälen
			^I tåreń				
Mansi T						wōlėm	FUålėn
Khanty Ka	^I sɔ̄rńi	^I kārti		^I kārti	1	ētpəŋkārti	
		Α _{wŏχ}	^A pătərūχ	ētəp	ēŋas лŏлрі	лŏлрі	Aśēlwŏχ
Khanty Ni	^I sɔ̄rńə	^I kārtə	^A pətərwŏ <i>x</i>	ētəp	χăntətŏtpə	tŏtpə	^A šoiteŋwŏχ
Khanty I	^I sōrńə	Α _{wăχ}	^A wərtəwăx	^A əntwăx	^{FU} xănt ūtən	^{FU} ūtən	^А јәт <i>w</i> ăҳ,
	sōrńəwăx				tătpə	rūt' tătpə	nāwə wăx
Khanty Su	^I sårńį	^А wăγ	^A kăntəywăy	Аллжау	капtәүлŏлрә	лŏлpə	^A jəmwăy
,			лŏr'nį wăy				
Khanty V	^I sărńз	^А wăy	^A pūtwăy	^A īnlwăy	^{FU} sēr ōlnз	^{FU} ōln3	Ajĕmwăy,
			^I lōrńз,			ńāmk ōlnз	nāyi wăy
			lōrńəwăy				sărńəwăy
Khanty Vj	^I sărńį	Α _{wăχ}	Ijōrńi,	^A īnlwăχ	F ^U nā̈yōlna	^{FU} ōlna	Anāyi wăx
	wěrtə sărńį		jōrńiwăy				nāyi sărhį
Hungarian	Iarany	Avas	D _{réz}	acél	^{FU} ón	^{FU} ólom	^I ezüst

Table 1. Metal names in the Finno-Ugric languages. Raised prefix letters indicate the proposed origin of metal name stems in published sources: ^G Germanic, ^S Scandinavian, ^{Sw} Swedish, ^{No} Norwegian; ^I Iranian; ^B Baltic or Iranian; ^{La} Latvian, ^R Russian; ^A Armenian or Tocharian; ^T Turkic; ^D Dagestan; ^{FU} Finno-Ugric. Local Finnic, Mordvinic, Mansi, Khanty, or Hungarian names are unmarked.

188

3. Names of iron

3.1. The proposed etymologies for Finnic **rauta* 'iron' are usually either the Proto-Germanic **rauđa-* (cf. SKES 751a) or **rauđan-* (cf. Tette Hofstra 1985: 91 and SSA sub *rauta*). Both reconstructions are based on the Old Norse masculine noun *rauđi* 'marsh ore' whose meaning is most intimately connected with iron. The noun *rauđi* is etymologically related with the Old Norse adjective *rauđr* 'red' and feminine noun *rauđa* 'red color; blood; yolk' (for Old Norse words, cf. de Vries 1962: 434–435). If we want to reconstruct a phonetically and semantically suitable Germanic origin for the Finnic stem, it should be the accusative case form *rauđa* of the word *rauđi*.

For the sake of comparison, Vladimir Terent'ev (1990: 31–32) proposed the Finnic stem **rauta* to be "a Krivich loanword where Slav. *au* had not undergone a change to *u*". Actually, all we know about the language of the Kriviches, the predecessors of the Byelorussians, are certain local variants in so-called Old Russian documents written by Byelorussian scribes. Note that the Old Russian orthography followed the Old Church Slavonic tradition of writing the vowel *u* as *oy*. The Old Church Slavonic (and Armenian) tradition of writing *u* with two letters (this sequence of two characters was considered one letter) followed the example of Greek where the sequence *ov* was pronounced as a diphthong in Ancient Greek but as [*u*] afterwards. In Slavic, the diphthong *ou* is partially retained only in Czech and in Polabian, an extinct West Slavic language spoken in the Elbe (Łaba) River tributary. However, even Czech has the monophthong *u* in this set of stems, cf. *ruda* 'ore' and *rudy* 'red'. Thus the proposed Slavic stem had undergone the change **ou* > *u* at a very early stage. Hence the Finnic stem **rauta* is not a Slavic loanword.

3.2. According to both editions of the Finnish etymological dictionaries SKES and SSA (s.v. *rauta*), the Saamic names for iron are borrowed from Finnish.

3.3. Words denoting 'iron' in Mordvinic, Mari, Permic, Mansi, and the northernmost Khanty dialects are considered Iranian loanwords borrowed from different sources in different times (Joki 1973: 273) and they clearly fall into four subtypes (cf. Table 1, above): (a) disyllabic words ending in hV (Mordvinic, Mari), (b) disyllabic words ending in *i* or a (Khanty), (c) monosyllabic words ending in *rt* (Permic), (d) monosyllabic words ending in *r* (Mansi). In the Mordvinic word denoting 'iron' the former vowel of the initial syllable was lost; occurrence of š instead of *rt* makes the stem special among the related stems. The component hV in Mordvinic k s h i and Mari k "urth" o, k arth i may have arisen on the analogy of the words denoting gold. In Mari, the four metal names end in a component h V or nV and the vowel V follows vowel harmony rules and varies mostly depending on the vowel of the preceding syllable.

The vowel *i* in the Khanty words has certain parallels in Iranian, cf. Avestan *karəti* 'knife'; the vowel *i* or its non-syllabic variant has caused the change

of t or d to č, š, or ž in certain Iranian and Indo-Aryan languages, such as Shugni $k\hat{a}r\check{c}$ 'steel' and Baluchi $k\bar{a}r\check{c}$, Wakhi $k\bar{s}\check{z}$. Probably the Mordvinic stem $k\check{s}ni$ was also borrowed from a source language that had undergone that change. The cluster rt is known from Avestan, Sanskrit, Sogdian, and Yaghnobi, whereas most Iranian languages have rd instead. Thus, it is possible that d is an innovation. Some Iranian languages have dropped the stop from the cluster, e.g. Kurdish $k\hat{e}r$. Probably the frontness of the vowel in the initial syllable of the Finno-Ugric iron names results from the fact that the vowel a attested in several Iranian languages is perceived more as a front vowel by speakers of a language where there is a contrast of a and \ddot{a} . Vowel length in Khanty words obviously reflects that in the source language. In most Iranian languages the stem has the meaning 'knife', so e.g. for Ossetic kard, Persian $k\bar{a}rd$, Tajik kord. It is possible that the semantic shift 'knife' > 'iron' took place in Finno-Ugric languages when the first iron knives and their names were received from Iranian people. On the other hand, the Hungarian word kard 'sword' still refers to a special subtype of knives.

3.4. In most Khanty dialects 'iron' is called $w\bar{a}\chi \sim w\bar{a}\gamma$, whereas in Hungarian it is *vas*. The history of the Khanty variant is problematic because of the unexplainable spirant $\chi \sim \gamma$. In dictionaries, the Khanty stem is presented also as having the meaning 'metal'. Still it is not clear whether the meaning 'metal' was an extension of the original meaning by native speakers or a scientific generalization obtained after seeing the names of the four metals discussed in this article. The native Khanty classification of the subclasses of iron includes alongside (a) steel (*antwă* $\chi = \bar{i}n_Aw\bar{a}\gamma$ 'blade iron') also (b) copper (*pătarū* $\chi \sim patarwŏ\chi$ 'story iron' or *pūtwă* γ 'melt iron' or *sõiteŋwŏx* 'heavy iron' or *jāmwă* γ 'good iron'or *nāwa wă* $\chi \sim nā\gamma$ i wà γ 'white iron'), and in Surgut, Vasjugan, and Vah also (d) gold (*sārńį wă* γ 'gold iron'). Still in Khanty the semantic space of 'iron' does not include tin or lead. Hence, *wă* $\chi \sim wă\gamma$ is not a general term for metals but instead the name for one of the three traditional metals alongside gold and lead.

4. Names of steel

Steel was first created as an alloy of iron and carbon in the process of smithing tools or weapons with a sharp edge or blade. The words denoting 'steel' are listed in the fourth column from the left in Table 1 above.

4.1. In Finnic, words denoting 'steel' directly hint at the blade. Livonian *tieroda* is a shortened form of the former compound *tiera/roda* 'blade iron' In other languages, derivatives of the stem **tera* 'blade' are found.

4.2. The obvious similarity of steel names in Saamic and Mordvinic results from the fact that the name for steel in Russian is a borrowing from Germanic. Here on the basis of the occurrence of palatalized lateral l', the Kildin Saami and Mordvinic names are considered borrowings from Russian, while North and Inari Saami words are considered borrowings from Norwegian. The criterion is somewhat vague, as the front vowel $\ddot{a}\ddot{a}$ in Inari Saami comes from earlier $*\bar{a}$ under the influence of the front vowel of the following syllable that probably, temporarily, caused also palatalization of the preceding *l*.

4.3. According to Gordeev. the Mari word for 'steel', *wurs*, Malmyž *wurŭs*, in the 18th century *urs*, is likely borrowed from Old Chuvash, cf. Chuvash $\chi urśä$, $\chi uráš$ 'steel' (Gordeev 1983: 173). However, this assumption is erroneous, because Chuvash word-initial χ - should be reflected as χ in Hill Mari and loss (Ø) in Meadow Mari (Räsänen 1920: 21–22), while Mari *w*- corresponds to Chuvash *v*- (op. cit. 54–60).

4.4. Steel names in Permic and North Mansi are usually considered Iranian borrowings (Joki 1973: 249–250). Still, among Iranian languages, the stem occurs only in Ossetic, cf. *andon* 'steel', and in some Scythian proper names. On the other hand, Abaev (1958: 156–157) brings comparisons from languages of three North Caucasian groups, cf. Ubykh *andān* 'chisel; sharp', Ingush *ondæ*, and Dargin *šandan* 'steel'.

4.5. Kazym and Nizam Khanty words denoting 'steel', $\bar{a}t \partial p$ and $\bar{e}t \partial p$, are derived from the verb stem $\bar{a}tt\partial - \langle Proto-Khanty *\bar{a}t - 'to temper'$ (Honti 1982: 130, number 70).

5. Names of copper

5.1. Saamic copper names go back to Proto-Saamic $v\bar{a}\bar{s}k\bar{e}$ (< $v\bar{a}\bar{s}k\bar{a}$) (according to Lehtiranta 1989: $v\bar{c}\bar{s}k\bar{e}$), and Finnic words go back to vaski : vaske < vaske. Problems connected with their background will be discussed in section 6.

5.2. The Erzya name for copper *piže* is based on the semantic extension of the identical color name *piže* 'green'.

5.3. Moksha copper names *śerəń* and *śerä* are connected with the Moksha gold name of Iranian origin, cf. section 2.2.

5.4. For Mari *würyenə*, Udmurt *jrgon*, Komi *jrgen*, Mansi *aryin*, different East-Iranian and Baltic sources have been proposed: (a) Sogdian *uyrani* 'blood' (cf. Joki 1962: 150–153; KÈSKJa 329); (b) Alanian, cf. Ossetic *ärχuə* 'copper' (Trautmann 1910: 458); (c) Baltic, cf. Old Prussian *wargien* 'copper', Lithuanian *vãrias*, *vãris*, Latvian *varš* (Gordeev 1973: 98–100, 1983: 196).

As the Sogdian script, derived from the Aramaic script, was written with consonant letters, the proposed reading *uyrani* of the Sogdian stem written *wyrn*- is problematic. The existence of another Sogdian stem *ywrn*- with the same meaning suggests that one of the stems may be misspelled. In any case, the order of consonants in the proposed donor language differs too much from that in Mari, Permic, and Mansi.

The proposed Alanian origin of the words denoting 'copper' is based on the evidence from Ossetic, the last surviving Northwest Iranian or Scythian language. Ossetic shares several metal names with Finno-Ugric. According to Abaev (1958: 186), the Ossetic word for copper $\ddot{a}r\chi u_{\partial}$ is of unclear origin. The Ossetic stem has no *n*, so probably Ossetic was not the actual donor. Due to the low first syllable vowel quality, the Konda Mansi stem is the closest to that in Ossetic. Moreover, according to Abaev, the variant $\alpha r\chi i$ occurs in Ossetic as well. In Permic, there are many cases where a former vowel **a* has changed to a high back vowel in inherited Finno-Ugric vocabulary. For Mari such a change is unusual, so probably the Mari word was borrowed from Udmurt, and later its first syllable became associated with the Mari word for blood (Meadow Mari *wür*, Hill Mari *wər*).

Obviously in order to explain the initial w in Mari copper names, Fedor Gordeev (1973: 98–100, 1983: 196) has proposed a common protoform *vargene for the Mari, Permic, and Mansi words and further suggested that it would have been a borrowing from Baltic. cf. Old Prussian wargien 'copper', Lithuanian vãrias, Latvian varš. Vjačeslav Ivanov (1983: 105) connects the Baltic words with Indo-European verbs such as Latvian $v\bar{a}r\bar{u}$ 'to boil' and Hittite μar 'to burn' (cf. also Karulis 1992: 491). Gordeev's etymology is incorrect due to phonological reasons, as (a) there was no reason to drop the initial consonant v- in Permic and Mansi and (b) there was no etymological g in the Old Prussian copper name (the word wargien should be read as [varjen], similarly to reading of sequences with ge in Baltic German).

5.5. Konda Mansi *tåreń*, Vah Khanty *lōrńs*, and Vasjugan *jōrńi* come from the Iranian stem for gold, cf. section 2.2.

5.6. Bernát Munkácsi proposed that Hungarian *réz* descends from Avar *rez* 'red copper' (MNyTESz 405). According to Said Hajdakov (1973: 76) the Avar *rez* is not 'copper' but 'brass' similarly to the related stems in other Dagestan languages, cf. Andi *jez* 'brass', Bezhta *iez* 'yellow copper' (i.e. 'brass' or 'chalcopyrite'), Dargin *jaz* 'brass', Tsakhur *jez* 'brass'. In these Dagestan Northeast Caucasian words, the initial consonants together with the following vowel represent petrified word class prefixes. The Avar noun *rez* is unique among the related Dagestan nouns in containing a prefix beginning with *r* and may thus be secondary. On the other hand, the nouns beginning with *j* may well be related with the similar Turkic stem *jez* 'yellow copper' that was attested already in Old Turkic and occurs also in Kumyk, spoken in northwestern Dagestan.

Hartmut Katz (2003: 258–259) postulates a front vocalic source $r\ddot{a}\mu d^h chm$ in Early Proto-Aryan as the origin of the Hungarian word. In Aryan, there are also words in which a back vowel occurs, such as Sanskrit *lohá* 'reddish; reddish metal, copper', New Persian $r\bar{o}d$ copper', and front vocalic Greek and German verbs, cf. German *röten* 'to redden'.

Both explanations are highly hypothetical.

6. The background of Finnic *vaski/*vaskeand Saamic *väškē 'copper'

Saamic $v\bar{a}sk\bar{e}$ and Finnic $vaski \sim vaske$ - are considered etymological cognates with Erzya *uske* and Moksha *uskä* 'wire' from Proto-Mordvinic uska, and are found in several other stems not used as copper names, cf. Hill Mari *waž* and Meadow Mari *wož* 'ore' (in compounds), Udmurt *ves* and Komi *js* in words for tin (and lead) and silver, Tavda Mansi *küš*, West Mansi *weš*, North and Konda Mansi *wes* in compounds for lead, Khanty *way* and *wax* 'iron; metal; money', Hungarian *vas* 'iron', Tundra Nenets *jese*, Forest Nenets *wese* 'iron; money'; Enets *bese* 'iron', Nganasan *bása* 'iron; metal', Kamas *basa, wasa* 'iron', Turukhansk Selkup *kezā*, Taz, Tym, and Ket Selkup *kwezi* 'iron', Motor *baze* 'iron'.

6.1. The etymological dictionary of the Uralic languages (UEW 560) gives the words listed above a Uralic protoform *waśke, in which the stem vowel *e is reconstructed on the basis of Finnic. Juha Janhunen (1981: 225) has proposed for both Proto-Finno-Permic and Proto-Uralic the front vocalic stem *wäśkä with the stem vowel $*\ddot{a}$ based on the evidence of Saamic and Samoyedic. The sibilant $*\dot{s}$ is evidenced by Permic, North, and Konda Mansi, Hungarian, and Samoyedic data.

The words attested in the Uralic languages have been regarded as borrowings from different Indo-European sources: (a) from Armenian $oski^3$ 'gold' (first suggested by Adolphe Pictet in 1859 (SSA 3: 416)) and (b) from Proto-Tocharian (first suggested by G. S. Lane in 1970 (Joki 1973: 340); Lane also admitted the possibility of borrowing in the opposite direction), cf. Tocharian A *wäs* 'gold' and Tocharian B *yaza* 'gold'.

6.1.1. The Armenian word denoting 'gold' *voski* cannot be the source of the Uralic stem set because Indo-European predecessors of Armenians moved to Armenia only in the 7th century from Asia Minor. According to Vjačeslav Ivanov (1983: 105), the Armenian stem is borrowed, possibly from Urartian, cf. ushu 'silver' in the related Hurrian. Ivanov's assumption is based on Émile Benveniste's hypothesis on the Hurrian origin of the name of the vessel for producing pure gold in Greek, cf. Greek $\delta\beta\rho\nu\zeta\alpha$ and Hurrian huprushi. The Hurrians are believed to have entered northern Mesopotamia from the Armenian Highlands in around

^{3.} At least in modern Armenian the word is pronounced [voski-].

2500 BC. Although silver and gold are different enough, it is not clear whether the Armenian and Hurrian words are related to the Sumerian word *guškin* 'gold' mentioned in Joki (1973: 340).

6.1.2. The idea of the possible Tocharian origin of the Proto-Samoyedic stem **wesä* was reconciled by Juha Janhunen (1983: 120–121) for whom "it remained to be solved, whether the Finno-Ugric metal names with an internal **-k-* could also derive from a Tocharian source".

The Saamic, Finnic, and Mordvinic stems with k- as such cannot originate from Tocharian A *wäs* 'gold' and Tocharian B *yaza* 'gold' or Proto-Tocharian **wäsa*. The Tocharian hypothesis was criticized by Petri Kallio (2004: 132–133) and Paul Widmer (2002: 172–174). Vladimir Napol'skikh (2001: 374) accepts it only for Samoyedic **wesä*.

6.1.3. According to Hartmut Katz (2003: 255) the names, except Mari *waž*, go back to Proto-Uralic **wę̃škä* 'copper' and **wâškå* whence Finno-Permic **wăšká* and Proto-Samoyedic **wę̃šä* **wę̃škä* are considered as nominalized present tense participles of the verb stem **wę̃š*² 'to shine yellow or red'. As the verb stem **wę̃š*² is reconstructed on the basis of two Mansi derived verbs and one possible Khanty participle for which no cognates from other Finno-Ugric languages are found, it is a weak argument for the Uralic origin of the name for copper. Moreover, in order to derive the supposed Proto-Permic stem from the Proto-Uralic form, ad hoc sound changes must be postulated both for the vowel of the first syllable and for the following sibilant. Therefore the etymology proposed by Katz cannot be accepted.

6.1.4. Katz (2003: 256) proposed a common protoform with subsequent changes $h_2 \acute{e}iHos > h_2 \acute{a}iHos > Early Proto-Aryan <math>h_2 \acute{a}i2s > *w\acute{a}jas$ for a set of Indo-European copper names, such as Sanskrit $\acute{a}yas$ -, Avestan aiiah-, Latin *aes*, Gothic *ais* (Pokorny 1959: 15–16) and a set of iron names⁴ (e.g. Old Irish $\acute{a}rn$, Gallian *Isarno*-, cf. Pokorny 1959: 300) and postulated the oblique form $w\acute{a}isa$ derived from $*w\acute{a}jas$ as the etymological origin of the Mari protoform $*w\acute{a}ž$ of Hill Mari *waž* and Meadow Mari *wož*. The proposed chain, however, does not explain why the Proto-Indo-European *a*-colored laryngeal $*h_2$ changed to *w in Aryan or Iranian.

^{4.} Although the two stem sets share the sounds *i* and *s* and both denote a metal, it hardly means that the sets are etymologically related.

6.2. Actually, the words under discussion exhibit a set of problematic occurrences:

- (1) in Saamic, Finnic, and Mordvinic stems the correspondence of stem vowels (i.e. of final vowels of the 2nd syllable) is irregular;
- (2) Words denoting 'copper' in Saamic, Finnic, and Mordvinic differ from other Uralic languages because they have a second syllable beginning with a *-k-* that has no corresponding elements in other languages (cf. Table 1, above).
- (3) In Khanty, in the semantically corresponding words the spirant γ or χ occurs instead of a sibilant found in other languages.

6.2.1. As an explanation of the second syllable beginning with k in Saamic, Finnic, and Mari metal names, occurrence of the derivational suffix ka was proposed in Carpelan & Parpola (2001: 127). This proposal must be questioned because of the irregularity of stem vowels attested in contemporary languages. Moreover, it has not been demonstrated why a suffix would occur in the given stem.

6.2.2. On the northwestern coast of Lake Onega in Karelia, in the Volga-Kama region, and in the Urals, copper was smelted from certain minerals approximately in 3000 BP. Obviously somewhere in this region the copper names with the segment *-kV* were once created. Hence we must ask what the segment *-kV* denotes in the Finnic and Saamic copper names. The Finnic reconstruction **vaski : *vaske- < *vaśke(-)* 'copper' is reminiscent of the Estonian word for 'mill', namely Estonian *veski* (dial. *veske*), which is etymologically a shortened form of the former compound word for 'water mill' **vesikivi* 'water + stone', cf. also Erzya *ved'gev* 'mill' from **ved' + kev* 'water + stone'. So it is conceivable to suppose that also **vaski* is a former compound whose second component was the noun **kivi : *kive*, copper was received from a mineral, a stone. In all likelihood, all metals were first classified as stones.

As the Finno-Ugric word **kive* is lacking from all Saamic languages, the Saamic stem is probably a Finnic borrowing. When looking for Finnic candidates for the first component of the compound, just two nouns beginning in *vas-* are of interest, namely *vasama* 'arrow (with blunt arrowhead); thunderbolt' (cf. SSA 3: 415), and *vasara* 'hammer; ax' with equivalents in Saamic (**vāččir*, cf. North Saami *væčir*) and Mordvinic (Erzya *uźeŕ*, Moksha *uźəŕ*) that show that the earlier stem was **vaśara*. The word itself is an Aryan borrowing, cf. e.g. Avestan *vazra-* 'club; pestle', Sanskrit *vajraḥ* 'thunderbolt' (UEW 815–816; SSA 3: 415). Note that although *vasara* is a borrowing and the word *vasama* may be a borrowing, their components *ma* and *ra* in the 3rd syllable were and still are perceived as suffixal, and *vasa- < *vaśa* is intuitively extracted as a stem. So it is possible that both a mineral containing copper and attracting lightning, and the metallic product of the mineral as a material for making more effective weapons and tools, e.g. hammers and axes could be called **vaśakive 'vaśa-*stone', which

later was shortened to **vaśki* and **vaśke-*. This stem that is not attested as an independent word any longer is identical with the Indo-European stem **vaśa*, reconstructed by Asko Parpola (Carpelan & Parpola 2001: 127):

If Proto-Uralic **wäśkä* 'metal' ends in a Uralic suffix **ka/kä*, Proto-Aryan and Old Indo-Aryan *vấśī* 'bronze axe or adze' (as a *vrddhi* derivative from **vaśa* '*bronze') might be related to it.

What remains problematic is the original meaning of the Indo-European stem. The data presented by Alexander Lubotzky (2001: 312) contain no hint to bronze:

**uaćī*-f. 'axe, pointed knife': Skt. *vā́sī* f. 'axe, adze, chisel'; LAv. (Yasna 42.4) *vāsī* 'pointed knife (?)', Oss. *wæs* (better *was* ?) 'axe, wood-chopper'.

It must be assumed that axes, adzes, and chisels are older than bronze and have preserved their former names even when made of bronze. Moreover it is improbable that names for 'thunderbolt', such as Sanskrit *vajraḥ* and Finnic **vasama* were derived from a metal name.

Alongside the Indo-Aryan stem there exists a somewhat similar and simpler metal name in Circassian (Northwest Caucasian) languages. In the Circassian languages, certain metal names are composed by means of the stem $\gamma^w a \sim \gamma^w e \sim \gamma^w \partial$, which may be related with $\gamma^w e$ 'yellow, red'. In the extinct Ubykh, spoken first on the northeastern coast of the Black Sea, and last in Turkey after the Russian invasion, there are several metal names such as $w \partial s^w e$ 'copper' and $w \partial c^w e$ 'iron' in which the former γ^w was changed to w, cf. also $s^w e$ 'bright' and $c^w e$ 'grey' (Šagirov 1977: 131–132). In other Circassian languages the initial consonant γ^w is retained and the attributive component of word for copper is $pl'\partial$ 'red'). So, it can be asked whether the Aryan and Northwest Caucasian stems are related.

The borrowed protoform **vaśa* in the Uralic languages allows us to explain all later stem variants with front vowels as resulting from the assimilative influence of the palatalized sibilant **s* and all stem variants with the sibilant *š* or \tilde{z} as developments of **s*. The occurrence of the spirant χ or γ in Khanty names can be explained by alleging that the metal name was borrowed either from an Iranian dialect where the sibilant had undergone the Iranian local change **s* > **h* in 1000–1500 BC or from a Dagestan language, cf. Avar $ba\chi \sim pa\chi$ 'copper', Chamalal, Hunzib $ba\chi$ 'copper', Bezhta bak 'copper'.

7. Changes in the semantic system of words denoting 'copper', 'gold', and 'iron'

The somewhat irregular system of related stems in names of different metals in Finno-Ugric languages gets an explanation if we suppose that the relationship between different meanings was reorganized and semantic shifts took place between the metal names.

The rise of an unknown metal name or a semantic shift in a given language can be defined as a new (micro)stage in the history of a language. Assuming that copper was the first metal that the early Finno-Ugrians came to know, and the two layers of words denoting 'gold' discussed in section 2 are correct, there are altogether 10 stages in the history of 'copper', 'gold' and 'iron' that can be singled out as follows: Copper 1, Copper 2, Copper 3; Gold 1, Gold 2; Iron 1; Wire / Ore / Metal.

It was found that the 10 stages form 19 ordered pairs of the possible 45 pairs are strictly ordered, namely: {Copper 1, Copper 2}, {Copper 1, Copper 3}, {Copper 1, Iron 1}, {Copper 1, Iron 2}, {Copper 1, Wire}, {Copper 1, Ore}, {Copper 1, Metal}; {Copper 2, Copper 3}; {Copper 3, Gold 2}; {Gold 1, Copper 3}, {Gold 1, Gold 2}; {Iron 1, Copper 2}, {Iron 1, Iron 2}; {Wire, Copper 2}, {Wire, Copper 3}; {Ore, Copper 2}, {Ore, Copper 3}; {Metal, Copper 2}, and {Metal, Copper 3}. The stages Iron 1, Wire, Ore, and Metal are complementary. For the sake of comparability as to Iron 2, Iron 1 is presented in a column of its own; Wire, Ore, and Metal are presented together in a single column. As the number of strictly ordered pairs of stages is modest, it is possible to build several formally correct tables. Table 2 is one such table. It must be noted that Copper 1 and Gold 1 are not strictly ordered. Hence words for copper cannot be proven to be older than gold names, and vice versa. Copper 2, which reflects copper names as a subclass of iron, cf. section 3.4, is partially a stage of indefinite length and even intersects the Copper 3 stage in Vasjugan where the compound $p\bar{u}tway$ 'pot iron' probably occurs later than the word *lorńs* 'copper'.

	Copper 1	Iron 1	Wire / Ore / Metal	Copper 2	Iron 2	Gold 1	Со	oper 3	Gold 2
Saamic	1 *vāška	*rōvte				*kollē			
Finnic	2 *vaske-	*rauta				*kulta			
Md	3 *uśka	7	∖3 *uśka		🕖 kšńi	0 *serəń	↗ ∖0	serəń	O sirńe
Mari	(4) *waž	7	∖④ waž		Ø kürthö		1	würyene	🛿 šörthö
Komi	5 -jś	7	`≤ 5 -į́ś		3 kert		2	įrgon	🕑 zarńi
Ud	6 -veś	7	`≤ 6 -veś		3 kort		2	įrgęn	🕑 zarńi
MnSo	6 -wəs	7	`≤ 6 -w∂s		@ kēr		3	aryin	🛿 sōrhi
MnKo	?				@ kēr	🛛 tåreń	↗ ∖@) tåreń	🛿 sarəń
MnP	?				?	🛚 tariń	↗ ∖€	tariń	?
KhaKa	🗇 wŏχ	∧ ∖⑦ wŏχ		pătərūx	kārti				🛿 sōrhi
KhaNi	🗇 wŏχ	∧ ∖⑦ (wŏχ)		pətərwŏx	kārtə				🛿 sōrńə
Khal	🗇 wăχ	∧ >⑦ wăχ		wərtəwăx					?
KhaSu	🗇 wăγ	∧		kăntəywăy		🚯 лŏrńį	↗ ∖4	лŏrńə-	🕑 sårńj
KhaV	🗇 wăy	∧		pūtwăy		Iorńs	↗ ∖4	lōrńз	🛿 sărńз
KhaVj	🗇 wăχ	∧ >⑦ wăχ				1 jōrńi	↗ ∖4	jōrhi	?
Hu	8 vas	∧ ∖® vas				6 arany		réz	

Table 2. The mutual relationship between metal names in Finno-Ugric languages.

Abbreviations

KhaI	Irtyš Khanty	Md	Mordvin
KhaKa	Kazym Khanty	MnKo	Konda Mansi
KhaNi	Nizjam Khanty	MnP	Pelym Mansi
KhaSu	Surgut Khanty	MnSo	Sos'va Mansi
KhaV	Vah Khanty	Oss.	Ossetic
KhaVj	Vasjugan Khanty	Skt.	Sanskrit
Hu	Hungarian	Ud	Udmurt
LAv.	Late Avestan		

References

- Abaev = Абаев, В. И. 1958: Историко-этимологический словарь осетинского языка. І. А-К. Москва–Ленинград.
- Carpelan, Christian & Parpola, Asko 2001: Emergence, contacts and dispersal of Proto-Indo-European, Proto-Uralic and Proto-Aryan in archaeological perspective. – Christian Carpelan, Asko Parpola & Petteri Koskikallio (eds), Early Contacts between Uralic and Indo-European. Linguistic and Archaeological Considerations. MSFOu 242. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne. 55–150.
- Gordeev = Гордеев Φ. И. 1973: Из истории балтийской лексики марийского языка. – Latvijas PSR Zinātņu Akadēmijas Vēstis 23.3. Rīga. 98–106.

- Gordeev = Гордеев, Ф. И. 1983: Этимологический словарь марийского языка. Том 2. В-Д. Йошкар-Ола.
- Hajdakov = Хайдаков, С. М. 1973: Сравнительно-сопоставительный словарь дагестанских языков. А-Н. Москва 1977.
- Hofstra, Tette 1985: Ostseefinnisch und Germanisch. Frühe Lehnbeziehungen im nördlichen Ostseeraum im Lichte der Forschung seit 1961. Groningen.
- Honti, László 1982: Geschichte des obugrischen Vokalismus der ersten Silbe. Bibliotheca Uralica 6. Budapest.
- Ivanov, Vjačeslav = Иванов, Вяч. Вс. 1983: История славянских и балканских названий металлов. Москва.

Janhunen, Juha 1981: Uralilaisen kantakielen sanastosta. – JSFOu 77: 219–274.

- 1983: On early Indo-European-Samoyed contacts. Symposium saeculare Societatis Fenno-Ugricae 1. – 3. XII. 1983. MSFOu 185. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne. 115–127.
- Joki, Aulis J. 1962: Finnisch-ugrisches im Ossetischen? Commentationes Fenno-Ugricae in honorem Paavo Ravila. MSFOu 125. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne.
- 1973: Uralier und Indogermanen. Die älteren Berührungen zwischen den uralischen und indogermanischen Sprachen. MSFOu 151. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne.
- JSFOu = Journal de la Société Finno-Ougrienne. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne.
- Kallio, Petri 2004: Tocharian loanwords in Samoyed? *Etymologie, Entlehnungen und Entwicklungen. Festschrift für Jorma Koivulehto zum 70. Geburtstag.* Mémoires de la Société Néophilologique de Helsinki LXIII. Helsinki. 129–137.
- Karulis, Konstantīns 1992: Latviešu etimoloģijas vārdnīca divos sējumos. II. P-Ž. Rīga: «Avots».
- Katz, Hartmut 2003: Studien zu den älteren indoiranischen Lehnwörtern in den uralischen Sprachen. Aus dem Nachlaß herausgegeben von Paul Widmer, Anna Widmer und Gerson Klumpp. Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag C. Winter.
- KÈSKJa = В. И. Лыткин, Гуляев, Е. С. 1970: Краткий этимологический словарь коми языка. Москва.
- KT = K. F. Karjalainens Ostjakisches Wörterbuch I–II. Bearbeitet und herausgegeben von Y. H. Toivonen. Lexica Societatis Fenno-Ugricae X. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne 1948.
- LÄGLOS = Lexikon der älteren germanischen Lehnwörter in den ostseefinnischen Sprachen I–III. Amsterdam – Atlanta, GA: Rodopi 1991–2012.
- Lehtiranta, Juhani 1989: *Yhteissuomalainen sanasto*. MSFOu 200. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne.
- Lubotsky, Alexander 2001: The Indo-Iranian substratum. Christian Carpelan, Asko Parpola & Petteri Koskikallio (eds), *Early Contacts between Uralic and Indo-European. Linguistic and Archaeological Considerations*. MSFOu 242. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne. 301–317.
- MNyTESz = *A magyar nyelv történeti-etimológiai szótára I–IV*. Budapest 1967–1984. MSFOu = Mémoires de la Société Finno-Ougrienne.
- MSzFE = A magyar nyelv szókészlet finnugor elemei I–III. Budapest 1967–1978.
- Napol'skikh, Vladimir 2001: Tocharisch-uralische Berührungen: Sprache und Archäologie. – Early Contacts between Uralic and Indo-European. Linguistic and Archaeological Considerations. MSFOu 242. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne. 367–383.

- Pokorny, Julius 1959: *Indogermanisches etymologisches Wörterbuch*. Bern München: Francke Verlag.
- Räsänen, Martti 1920: *Die tschuwassischen Lehnwörter im Tscheremissischen*. MSFOu XLVIII. Helsinki: Société Finno-Ougrienne.
- SSA = Erkki Itkonen & Ulla-Maija Kulonen (eds), *Suomen sanojen alkuperä* 1–3. Etymologinen sanakirja. Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seuran Toimituksia 556. Helsinki: Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seura 1992–2000.
- Šagirov = Шагиров, А. К. 1977: Этимологический словарь адыгских (черкесских) языков. А–Н. Москва.
- Terent'ev, V. A. 1990: Corrections to the "Suomen kielen etymologinen sanakirja" concerning Germanic, Baltic and Slavic loanwords. – Uralo-Indogermanica. Балтославянские языки и проблема урало-индоевропейских связей. Материалы 3-ей балто-славянской конференции, 18–22 июня 1990 г. Часть II. Москва. 30–32.
- UEW = Rédei, Károly: *Uralisches etymologisches Wörterbuch* I III. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó 1986–1991.Vries, Jan de 1962: *Altnordisches etymologisches Wörterbuch. Zweite verbesserte Auflage*. Leiden: Brill.
- Widmer, Paul 2002: Nugae uralo-tocharicae. *Finnisch-ugrische Mitteilungen* 24/25: 171–178.